Statewide Mask Mandates vs COVID-19 Hospitalizations

A case study of six U.S. states

Background

COVID-19 overthrew the entire world order in 2020. Originating in Wuhan, China, the virus quickly spread across the globe infecting nearly 15 million people and killing over 600 thousand as of July 20th. The United States of America has been one of the hardest hit countries in the world, as cases continue to surge throughout its southern region. As states look for ways to slow the spread of the virus, many have introduced mask mandates in public places. While scientific evidence suggests masks play a vital role in slowing the spread of the virus, some Americans and politicians have doubted the effectiveness of these new mask laws.





Methods

- We will be analyzing the mask mandates issued in six U.S. states:
 - California (June 18th)
 - Connecticut (April 20th)
 - Illinois (May 1st)
 - Massachusetts (May 6th)
 - New Mexico (May 16th)
 - New York (April 15th)
- We will look for a correlation between the mask mandate and current hospitalizations
- Next, we will replace the total number of current hospitalizations with the change in hospitalizations from the previous day
- The data used will be from the 2 weeks before and 2 weeks after the mandate was issued
- Hospitalization data is from The Atlantic



Current Hospitalizations vs Mask Mandate		Daily Change in Current Hospitalizations vs Mask Mandate	
Logistic Regression:		Logistic Regression:	
	P-value: 0.05327749		P-value: 0.01457337
	Odds ratio: 1.015663		Odds ratio: 1.013698
T-test:		T-test:	
	P-value: 0.0003307		P-value: 0.002072
	Means: 4494.143 5418.857		Means: 5.153846 149.285714



Connecticut

Current Hospitalizations vs Mask Mandate		Daily Change in Current Hospitalizations vs Mask Mandate	
Logistic Regression:		Logistic Regression:	
	P-value: 0.1935416		P-value: 0.01550641
	Odds ratio: 1.002556		Odds ratio: 0.9390018
T-test:		T-test:	
	P-value: 0.197		P-value: 0.0001274
	Means: 1665.214 1771.857		Means: 55.15385 -27.64286







Current Hospitalizations vs Mask Mandate		Daily Change in Current Hospitalizations vs Mask Mandate	
Logistic Regression:		Logistic Regression:	
	P-value: 0.6331815		P-value: 0.2853898
	Odds ratio: 0.9990738		Odds ratio: 0.997441
T-test:		T-test:	
	P-value: 0.6471		P-value: 0.2889
	Means: 4681.857 4646.286		Means: 38.38462 -34.28571



Massachusetts

Current Hospitalizations vs Mask Mandate		Daily Change in Current Hospitalizations vs Mask Mandate	
Logistic Regression:		Logistic Regression:	
	P-value: 0.2128882		P-value: 0.04804592
	Odds ratio: 0.9704222		Odds ratio: 0.9827434
T-test:		T-test:	
	P-value: 5.555e-07		P-value: 0.03268
	Means: 3770.500 2996.857		Means: -26.76923 -76.42857





New Mexico

Current Hospitalizations vs Mask Mandate		Daily Change in Current Hospitalizations vs Mask Mandate	
Logistic Regression:		Logistic Regression:	
	P-value: 0.01072564		P-value: 0.1373284
	Odds ratio: 1.330029		Odds ratio: 0.9215829
T-test:		T-test:	
	P-value: 0.000466		P-value: 0.1312
	Means: 189.1429 209.2857		Means: 3.8461538 -0.9285714





Current Hospitalizations vs Mask Mandate		Daily Change in Current Hospitalizations vs Mask Mandate	
Logistic Regression:		Logistic Regression:	
	P-value: 0.06619568		P-value: 0.06066744
	Odds ratio: 0.999619		Odds ratio: 0.986418
T-test:		T-test:	
	P-value: 0.05673		P-value: 7.089e-06
	Means: 16924.50 15393.57		Means: 497.7692 -432.2143





All 6 States

Current Hospitalizations vs Mask Mandate		Daily Change in Current Hospitalizations vs Mask Mandate	
Logistic Regression:		Logistic Regression:	
	P-value: 0.7913827		P-value: 0.000603897
	Odds ratio: 0.9999922		Odds ratio: 0.9961534
T-test:		T-test:	
	P-value: 0.7928		P-value: 5.255e-05
	Means: 5287.560 5072.786		Means: 95.58974 -70.36905







Conclusions

- As an overall trend, hospitalizations were lower after the mask mandates.
- When looking at total current hospitalizations, there is no statistically significant correlation.
- In California and New Mexico the correlation is statistically significant, but it actually shows the mandate correlating with increased hospitalizations.
- In New York there is a somewhat significant correlation between the mask mandate and decreased hospitalizations.
- This statistic seems to be a poor measurement of the effects of the mask mandate since a high number of hospitalizations before it is put in place can lead to a correlation showing increased hospitalizations after the mandate even if they decrease slightly from the peak (see New Mexico graph as an example).

Conclusions (continued)

- The change in current hospitalizations from the previous day seems to be a more accurate indicator of the effects of the mask mandate.
- There is a statistically significant inverse correlation overall between the mask mandate and the change in hospitalizations from day to day.
- In terms of individual states, this correlation is statistically significant in Connecticut, Massachusetts, and New York.
- When using change in hospitalizations the mask mandate in New Mexico no longer correlates with increased hospitalizations, and instead has an insignificant correlation with a decreasing change in hospitalizations
- California seems to be an outlier amongst these states, as they still have a significant correlation between the mandate and an increasing change in hospitalizations
- No conclusions can be drawn about the effectiveness of the mandate in Illinois.

Summary

- There is limited evidence to suggest mask mandates were successful within 2 weeks in New York, Massachusetts, and Connecticut.
- The change in hospitalizations after the mask mandate in California was the opposite of what was intended.
- We do not have enough evidence to support a link between a mask mandate and COVID-19 hospitalizations in Illinois and New Mexico.
- While the overall association between a statewide mask mandate and a more negative change in hospitalized patients is encouraging, more research will need to be done to determine if this link is coincidental or a direct result of the regulations put in place.



https://www.axios.com/states-face-coverings-mandatory-a0e2fe35-5b7b-458e-9d28-3f6cdb1032fb.html https://www.cnet.com/health/where-are-face-masks-required/ https://covidtracking.com/data https://covid19.healthdata.org/united-states-of-america